

Teachers' Readiness, Compliance, and Difficulties in the Full Implementation of Face-to-Face Learning in an Asean State

Kenn C. Manipula

Abstract:- This study aims to determine the teacher's level of readiness, the extent of compliance, and difficulties in the full implementation of face-to-face learning in a highly urbanized district in Indonesia during the School Year 2022-2023. The study's respondents are 150 teachers from five (5) different private schools in a city-state in one Asian country. The independent variables are age, sex, civil status, and highest educational attainment. The areas of the study included instructional materials, management of learning, and administration of assessments.

The result of the study showed that teachers' readiness and compliance in the full implementation of face-to-face learning was at a high level, and the difficulty level was also high.

There was a significant difference in the level of readiness in terms of Management of Learning when grouped and compared according to highest educational attainment. When grouped and compared according to the abovementioned variables, there was no significant difference in the extent of compliance in the full implementation of face-to-face learning. The difficulties in fully implementing face-to-face learning were similar when grouped and compared according to the abovementioned variables.

I. INTRODUCTION

➤ *Background of the Study*

The Indonesian Government advised beginning to open the school for offline learning with strict COVID-19 prevention protocol in early September 2021. However, this policy caused teachers to worry because, according to them, it may take some time to read the classrooms, the school facilities, and the equipment and meet all other face-to-face learning challenges. Furthermore, the parents were anxious and concerned about their children's health (Sutini et al., 2022).

Teachers' readiness for the full implementation of face-to-face learning ranges from classroom preparation to health concerns, according to Delvigne-Jean (2022). As Jakarta started to loosen its restrictions after 18 months of closing schools, national and local authorities have implemented measures to support schools, particularly the teachers across 34 provinces and 247 districts. In the full

implementation of face-to-face classes, teachers are expected to provide quality education alongside safety environment and re-defined friendship in every classroom. In the run-up to the re-opening, teachers have held online meetings with parents to make sure the correct safety measures are followed. Washbasins have been installed before every class, and hand sanitizers are prepared.

The compliance of academic institutions at the onset of the order to re-open schools dragged to merely 50% in the first month. According to the Jakarta Education Agency, it slowly curved toward the end of 2021. Ulfiana (2021) stated that with only three times a week open (Monday et al.), the parents and students were advised to continue cautious actions because Indonesia was holding the highest record of mortality in the entire world at that time.

Relative to the challenges faced by teachers, parents were adamant about permitting their children to join face-to-face classes because of their fear of infection. Additionally, new and returning students from online classes demonstrated a slower learning pace and lower numeracy and literacy skills than face-to-face learning. These were a few of the challenges faced by teachers at the start of the face-to-face classes.

As a school head himself, the researcher observed that one of the imminent problems faced by school teachers in the full implementation of face-to-face learning is the physical readiness of classrooms, reduced parental involvement due to fear of infection, adjustments in the shift of learning modality from virtual to school and many others. There were many adjustments to be made by the teachers to acclimate young learners to face-to-face learning. These challenges motivated the researcher to conduct this study.

➤ *Statement of the Problem*

This study aimed to determine the teacher's readiness level, compliance, and difficulties in fully implementing face-to-face learning in a highly urbanized district in Indonesia during the School Year 2022-2023.

Specifically, this study sought to answer the following questions:

1. What is the profile of the respondents in terms of the following variables?
 - a. Age
 - b. Sex
 - c. Civil Status
 - d. Highest Educational Attainment
2. What is the teacher’s level of readiness in the full implementation of face-to-face learning according to the following areas?
 - a. Instructional Materials
 - b. Management of Learning
 - c. Administration of Assessments
3. What is the teacher’s extent of compliance in fully implementing face-to-face learning according to the aforementioned areas?
4. What is the teacher’s difficulty level in fully implementing face-to-face learning according to the aforementioned areas?
5. What is the teacher’s level of readiness in the full implementation of face-to-face learning when grouped according to the aforementioned variables?
6. What is the teacher’s extent of compliance in the full implementation of face-to-face learning when grouped according to the aforementioned variables?
7. What is the teacher's difficulty level in fully implementing face-to-face learning when grouped according to the aforementioned variables?
8. Is there a significant difference in the teacher’s level of readiness in the full implementation of face-to-face learning when grouped and compared according to the aforementioned variables?

9. When grouping and comparing the variables above, are there any significant differences in adherence for teachers who implement full face-to-face instruction?
10. When grouped and compared using the variables above, are there any significant differences in the difficulty of teachers who fully implement face-to-face instruction?

➤ *Hypotheses*

In order to answer these specific objectives, the following hypotheses were formulated and to be tested:

- There is no significant difference in the teacher’s level of readiness in the full implementation of face-to-face learning when grouped and compared according to the aforementioned variables.
- When grouped and compared according to the aforementioned variables, there is no significant difference in the teacher’s extent of compliance in the full implementation of face-to-face learning.
- When grouped and compared according to the aforementioned variables, there is no significant difference in the teacher’s difficulty level in the full implementation of face-to-face learning.

➤ *Assumption of the Study*

To further the study, the following assumptions were formulated.

- Willingness to fully implement face-to-face instruction varies up to a certain level.
- There is some variability in adherence to the full implementation of face-to-face classes.
- There are varying degrees of difficulty in fully implementing face-to-face instruction.

Table 1 Study Variables, Indicators, and Categories

Variables	Indicators	Categories
Age	Number of years in existence	Younger (Below 39 years old)
		Older (39 years old and above)
Sex	Sex at Birth	Male
		Female
Civil Status	State of being married or unmarried	Single
		Married
Highest Educational Attainment	Latest Academic Achievement	Lower (Bachelor's Degree)
		Higher (Masters' Degree)

II. THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

This study was anchored on three formidable theories, namely: The theory of Readiness by Edward Thorndike (1949), the Theory of Compliance by Gary Becker and George Stigler (1974), and the theory of Optimal Challenges in Education by Robert Yerkes and John Dodson (1908).

According to the Law of Readiness, "a satisfying state of affairs results when an individual is ready to learn and is permitted to do so." Being pushed to study when you are not ready, or being stopped from learning when you are ready, results in an inconvenient situation" (Kolpin et al., 2018).

This theory applies to the present study because it discusses teachers' readiness to implement face-to-face classes. As discussed by Thorndike, he asserted that one must desire to learn the task being presented and must possess the requisite knowledge and skills. Reading themselves and addressing various challenges related to face-to-face learning are requisites to success. Teachers best acquire new knowledge when they see a clear reason for doing so, often show a strong interest in learning what they believe is needed to know next, and tend to set aside things they see no immediate need.

Readiness to learn also includes the "teachable moment," or a period of educational opportunity when a person is most receptive to learning something new. Recognizing and capitalizing on "teachable moments" in aviation training is one of the most critical abilities to master as an instructor. In flight training, an instructor might locate or create instructional opportunities such as pattern work, air work in the local practice area, cross-country, flight review, or instrument proficiency check (Hergenbahn & Olson, 2015).

This research was also founded on Gary Becker and George Stigler's (1974) Theory of Compliance. The idea is founded on the notion of lone agents who selected between many choices based on higher benefit and lowest cost. The major justification for enhancing compliance is to increase the penalties for violations (mostly to combat crime) or to give a bonus or other monetary incentive for cooperation (a common argument for environmental legislation). This theory also takes into account the fact that individual decisions are embedded in existing relational structures. In other words, decision-theoretic approaches such as those used by Becker assume that the recipient makes decisions as a function of a set of fixed constraints. This is because the (mainly endogenous) variability of these constraints is taken into account. Actors adjust their actions based on personal choices, which can have counter-intuitive consequences. But decision theory offered a more nuanced suggestion. For example, increasing fines for non-compliance cannot have a positive or negative impact on compliance.

In addition, this work is based on Robert Yerkes and John Dodson's Theory of Optimal Tasks in Education (1908). This theory suggests optimal arousal levels for best performance on learning tasks. From an academic perspective, "teacher expectations must be aligned with the abilities and actual needs of the students."

This theory is applicable to the present study because it takes into account the various challenges faced by private secondary school teachers in introducing face-to-face teaching to meet the academic needs of learners.

This theory is equally relevant to this study because it takes into account all factors related to the difficulty of teachers in engaging learners as much as possible and coping adequately with all other relevant tasks. doing.

The operation of the central limit theorem, theories of teaching and learning, learning outcomes, and student feedback have supported the proposed theory across areas such as statistics, mechanics, quality, and ergonomics. Persistent optimization challenges were observed in most courses taught using the proposed theory.

III. CONCEPTUAL FRAMEWORK

This study aimed to determine the teacher's readiness level, compliance, and difficulties in fully implementing face-to-face learning in a highly urbanized district in Indonesia during the School Year 2022-2023.

The areas in this study included the learning environment, teaching strategies, and instructional materials. These areas were adapted from the 2022 study by Stoian et al. conducted in Romania about transitioning from online to face-to-face classes. The study discussed the pros and cons of online learning and created a clear contrast with face-to-face learning.

The study variables included are age, gender, civil status, and highest educational attainment. According to the Smart Survey Team of the United Kingdom, age is a useful parameter in research because the knowledge and experiences of a person about a certain topic are often determined by their age. As to gender or sex (male versus female), the differences in the opinion of the respondents may be due to their sex group, which is mostly influenced by gender-related priorities.

Concerning their Civil Status, their marital statuses influence the respondents' priorities, outlooks, and beliefs. Their highest educational attainment is the source of their knowledge and understanding. Thus, insights are mostly influenced by their education.

Levels of teacher readiness and levels of difficulty were measured using a 5-point scale continuum with the following ranges: 5 is highest or 'very high', 4 is 'high', 3 is 'medium', 2 is 'low' and 1 is lowest or 'very low'.

The degree of teacher adherence was measured on a 5-point scale continuum with the following ranges: 5 is highest or "very high", 4 is "high", 3 is "moderate", 2 is "low", 1 is lowest or "very low". ."

➤ *Scope of the Study*

This study used a descriptive research design to determine teacher readiness, adherence, and difficulty in fully implementing face-to-face instruction. It was conducted in a highly urbanized district of Indonesia. The study respondents were 180 private secondary school teachers.

Data for this study were collected using the two-part survey questionnaire designed by the researcher. The survey tool was submitted to his five experts for content verification. Reliability was established through trial operation by 30 private junior high school teachers in neighboring school districts. A descriptive and comparative analysis scheme was used in this study. The statistical tools used in this study are frequency counts and percentages, means, and Mann-Whitney.

➤ *Significance of the Study*

The findings of this study would benefit the following offices and personalities:

- *Teachers*

This study will help establish issues close to the heart of teachers and help them identify their own weak and strong points – for action purposes. Teachers may also benefit from this study as it will reveal their readiness, compliance, and challenges.

- *District Supervisors*

This study will also be useful for the District Supervisors because the result will be updated and fresh from the field. Based on the results, the supervisors may act appropriately in areas with high challenges.

- *School Heads*

The School Head may use this study's results as the window to crafting future readiness and compliance training. As to the challenges, this study may help the school heads identify critical areas for improvement or immediate action.

- *Students*

The students are the ultimate beneficiary of all corrective measures intended to address teachers' difficulties in the currently implemented face-to-face learning, and this could positively lead to the provision of quality education, which is a hundred percent needed.

- *Parents*

The parents will be assured that the teachers are properly ready and on top of the challenges, and all these are being done for the benefit of their children.

- *Present Researcher*

This study will be very beneficial for the researcher, being a school head, because this will help identify the strength and weaknesses of the teachers in the newly implemented face-to-face learning.

- *Future Researchers*

Future researchers may benefit from the results of this study as this manuscript may serve as future reference material.

➤ *Definition of Terms*

The following terms are defined conceptually and operationally for the reader's clarity and understanding.

- *Administration of Assessments*

The term refers to a continuous and systematic process of finding goals. This means measuring goals, collecting goal measurements, using that information to make improvement decisions, and making improvements based on the data collected (Petazzoni, 2020).

This terminology was used in this study to describe the confirmation of learning, like giving periodic tests.

- *Age*

This study used this terminology to describe the confirmation of learning, like giving periodic tests. Operationally, this term refers to the survival time of the respondent, further divided into young and old.

- *Civil Status*

The term refers to the different choices you have to describe your relationship with your significant other. Married, single, divorced, and widowed are examples of civil status (Silva, 2019).

As used in this study, the term is used to determine a respondent's marital status, or whether they are married or single.

- *Compliance*

The term refers to following established guidelines or specifications or becoming so (Gillis, 2018).

In this study, the term refers to the implementation of orders to open schools to in-person classes.

- *Highest Educational Attainment*

Statisticians commonly use the term to refer to an individual's highest educational level (Conelly, 2016).

In this survey, the term is used to directly identify a respondent's highest degree (Bachelor's, Master's, Doctorate).

- *Highly Urbanized District*

The term means a contiguous area without vacant land consisting of urban centers (urban units) and rural districts with at least 10,000 employment or urban units (periurban) with at least 40% of the working-age population. Refers to a group of communities. The population working at the center of the community is attracted to this center (Rahayu, 2021).

The term used in this study refers to the high-income regions of Indonesia where this study is conducted. This special district is one of the central cities of the Indonesian capital.

- *Instructional Materials*

The term refers to a collection of materials, including animate and inanimate, human and non-human resources, that teachers can use to achieve desired learning outcomes in teaching and learning situations (Lewis, 2018).

In this study, the term is used to describe online or offline learning resources that teachers can use in contemporary face-to-face teaching.

- *Management of Learning*

This means that the emphasis is on "designing and implementing educational strategies to achieve learning outcomes". There is a balance of emphasis on curriculum development and pedagogy, and the emphasis is definitely on educational strategy (Lynch, 2019).

This terminology describes how education is being administered to learners with the ultimate goal of achieving higher academic performance.

- *Private Secondary School Teachers*

The term refers to teachers working in private schools. Private schools require tuition payments from families of participating students and do not rely on government funding (Austin, 2017).

In this study, the term refers to non-governmental educators who educate children in private schools in designated districts.

- *Sex*

The term refers to various biological characteristics of humans and animals. It is primarily associated with physical and physiological traits such as chromosomes, gene expression, hormone levels and function, and reproductive/sexual anatomy (Malcolm, 2020).

The term, as used in this study, refers to the gender classification of male or female respondents based on the first biological index assigned at birth.

IV. REVIEW OF RELATED LITERATURE

This chapter reviews previously conducted studies that have a close bearing on the present one. These studies helped the researcher discuss key points, particularly the areas chosen for this study.

➤ *Conceptual Literature*

- *Foreign*

CNN Philippines (2022) reported that public and private schools have reopened nationwide, and students have returned to in-person classes. According to the Department of Education (DepEd), he enrolled more than 28.03 million students this year. According to the report, while other parents and students waited for face-to-face classes to resume, some opposed the introduction.

CNN Philippines reported that the concerned Teachers' Union held a sunrise protest in Mendiola, Manila, calling for safe classes to resume. DepEd has a "non-discrimination policy" that allows learners and school staff to attend in-person classes regardless of whether they have been vaccinated against COVID-19. The Ministry of Health (2022) also said that only about 19% of students in the country were fully vaccinated against COVID-19, and 92% of faculty and non-faculty staff had completed vaccination, the ministry said. Announced three days before the start of classes.

A DepEd spokeswoman said there is no discrimination between vaccinated and non-vaccinated students as COVID-19 vaccination is not compulsory in the Philippines. Based on DepEd data, 92% of faculty and non-faculty staff have been vaccinated against COVID-19. Currently, 19% of

enrolled students have received their second vaccination (Magsambol, 2022).

In a study of teachers' willingness to host classes in the classroom for special education teachers in Saudi Arabia, Alawajee and Almutairi (2022) found that teachers could personally influence students to prepare for post-COVID-19 teaching and learning. I repeated that I needed to be prepared. The study found that it is always best to know the level of preparedness teachers have for in-person classes, as students' needs may be different today than they were then. Transitioning from distance to face-to-face learning is critical, as many parents and students feel anxious. We also need to overcome the negative effects of distance learning, where students' numeracy and literacy skills are much lower.

The same author said some students experienced mental and mental health problems during the lockdown. So, in parallel with these adjustments, we need to motivate some teachers to return to face-to-face classes. Social isolation is a recognized barrier to effective learning. Therefore, teachers should actively help children form social circles when they return to school.

Lee et al. (2022) pointed out that teacher readiness can be defined as teacher, institutional, and situational readiness. Examining how these three types of readiness affect teachers' instructional strategies is important for understanding the changes needed to ensure effective instruction for FB teachers. However, although the concept has been studied for decades, until recently, there was no uniform standard for measuring teacher engagement. Organizational support is essential for teachers to prepare for face-to-face classes. In this context, several studies have shown that the technical support provided by higher education institutions influences teacher motivation.

Similarly, Li et al. (2022) believe that it is widely accepted that teachers' willingness to engage in face-to-face teaching depends on their context. Existing research finds, for example, that differences between individualism and collectivism can influence technology acceptance in teaching and learning.

From a more explicit perspective, a World Bank policy note points out that school closures can lead to learning losses and adversely affect the well-being of current and future students. UNICEF also supports this position, citing research findings showing that children's classroom experiences are good predictors of "future social, emotional and educational outcomes" in a 2021 article (Sigue-Bisnar, 2022, p. 1).

It may be easier to ask what the school's compliance obligations are. Schools face many regulatory challenges, from financial compliance and safety to employment, anti-discrimination, property, and contractor issues. The amount of regulation increases every year. With negotiations postponed due to the impact of COVID-19, the prospect of negotiating corporate agreements is now a major challenge

for many schools. The recent premium rate hikes mean that unions and workers expect higher premiums than many schools expect. This places a significant financial burden on both public and private school budgets (Henebery, 2022).

The Government Department of Education has developed guidelines for online and modular distance learning in the Philippines. This is to prevent students from getting infected. However, the president approved a plan to conduct limited in-person delivery trials in low-risk areas of COVID-19 in January 2021. Still, it was later withdrawn due to the threat of COVID-19 was done. Despite one of the world's longest and most stringent lockdown measures, there are doubts as to whether the country is ready to open its schools to students for face-to-face classes (Sigue-Bisnar, 2022).

School reopening for face-to-face interactions must be carefully planned to ensure the safety of students, teachers, and school staff in a staged fashion, especially in following physical distancing. Planning and execution of school health protocols during this pandemic must be supported by the truthful data given by various institutions. Last December 11, 2020, the World Health Organization (WHO) published a checklist to support school reopening and preparing for a possible resurgence of COVID-19. WHO cited that 'The checklist is aligned with, and builds upon, existing COVID-19-related WHO guidelines and is structured around protective measures related to 1) hand hygiene and respiratory etiquette; 2) physical distancing; 3) use of masks in schools; 4) environmental cleaning and ventilation; and 5) respecting procedures for isolation of all people with symptoms.' The checklist helps policymakers and school officials enhance compliance and adherence to public health protocols during the pandemic.

In India, the Delhi Disaster Management Authority (DDMA) announced that schools would reopen for all classes from November 1 with certain conditions, including ensuring at most 50 percent attendance and not forcing parents to send their children to school. From a compliance perspective, schools are instructed to ensure the full vaccination of staff (Kuchay, 2021).

South Africa must carefully plan protocols for conducting in-person classes in line with international guidelines to ensure student safety or reduce the risk of COVID-19. It's best to remember that a student's life is as important as their education. The responsibility of every government is to ensure its fulfillment (Chisadza, 2021).

On the other hand, the study by Lessler et al. (2021) found that although there is evidence that the association between classroom instruction and further health education poses a risk to members of student households, this risk can be managed through the collective implementation of school-based remedial actions. Pointed out that it is possible. This is consistent with the Swedish findings, where the authors used a quasi-experimental approach to determine risks to parents and teachers. But many remain unknown.

We have not been able to measure the risks that in-person teaching poses to students themselves, nor have we been able to specifically assess how different policies affect teachers and other school staff.

In the United States, Lessler (2022) points to the ongoing debate about how face-to-face education should work, highlighting differences in approach between national independent school systems and individual homes. Lack of coordination led to understanding the risks of returning children to school and how remedial actions could mitigate those risks. The results presented here provide aspects of the evidence that decision-makers can consider in a complex policy environment with many competing risks and priorities. While online surveys have their limitations, the extensive scope of the COVID-19 symptom survey has allowed us to identify households participating in disparate school activities across the country in a way that only a few other studies have been able to do. We were able to collect the data. Analysis of this data supports the notion that face-to-face education puts household members at increased risk of COVID-19. However, we also found evidence that common low-cost mitigations can mitigate this risk.

From another perspective, Lin (2021) argued that universities worldwide face enormous challenges and opportunities in the post-pandemic era as schools return to face-to-face classes. Initially, schools in Taiwan were operating as normal, and students had to attend classes as scheduled. However, strict regulations are in place to ensure the safety of students and teachers. Nonetheless, following the sporadic spread of COVID-19 in 2020, university departments have started integrating online and face-to-face classes and will transition fully to online learning in May 2021. and this will continue until the end of the semester. For this reason, assessing the experiences and challenges of teachers and students alike is important to determine the impact of these changing learning styles (Lin, 2021).

- *Local*

In Indonesian education, the government has deemed it a mandatory option for educational institutions to conduct limited face-to-face classes under strict health protocols. This policy considered all the difficulties during the emergency learning of the pandemic while the pandemic is gradually declining. To comply with government orders, the Ministry of Education and Culture must ask and answer the following questions:

What are your students' thoughts on opening schools and implementing face-to-face classes in Indonesia, and what do they hope to achieve with face-to-face classes (Soesanto & Dirgantoro, 2021)?

The Indonesian government recommended opening schools for offline learning in early September 2021 under strict COVID-19 prevention protocols. However, this policy may cause parents to worry about their child's health during in-person classes. This study focuses on parents'

perspectives and readiness for their children's digital use, leaving parental beliefs, attitudes, and offline learning during the COVID-19 pandemic intact (Sutini et al. , 2022).

In Indonesia, the joint ministerial decree reflects that reopening schools after COVID-19 requires various ministries' active and cooperative involvement in the decision-making process. This is because the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA) has jurisdiction over religious schools consisting of the primary and secondary level Ibtidaiya Theological Seminary (MI), Tsanawiya Seminary (MT), and Aliyah Seminary (MA).

In this respect, the policy of the Joint Decree adopts the principle of cooperative governance. Experts argued that governance, broadly speaking, is the system of laws, rules, judicial decisions, and administrative practices that limit, regulate, and enable the provision of goods and services with public funds. Furthermore, the joint ministerial decree adopts the meaning of governance as merely a decision-making process. This process refers to the decisions implemented or not implemented. Based on these arguments, governance analysis focuses on formal and informal actors. These two types of actors are involved in decision-making and decision-making, and formal and informal structures are aimed at decision-making and enforcement (Hendarman, 2022).

In the capital, Jakarta, 610 schools, or 11.4% of the city's schools, resumed physical education classes lasting up to four hours on Monday (August 30). More than 2,500 schools in Central Java and parts of West Java have made similar efforts. Different regions have introduced different face-to-face teaching methods. Some schools have capped classes at 30% of total capacity, a stricter precautionary measure than the 50% cap set by the government. Some even allow half of their students to attend class on a daily rotation.

The Indonesian government released data showing nationwide school closures affected more than 60 million Indonesian students in March 2020. Since then, 39% of schools have resumed limited face-to-face classes from 6 September 2021, following national guidelines. When considering opening a school, you should consider how to implement necessary public health measures, such as B. Maintain physical distancing, maintain a distance of at least one meter, and allow students to wash their hands regularly with soap. However, it should be understood that schools do not operate in isolation. Schools are part of the community," said Dr. Mr. Paranietharan, WHO Indonesia Representative. "Therefore, it is also important to control transmission in these communities when schools open" (Delevingne-Jean, 2022, p. 4).

The Indonesian government has decided to resume face-to-face classes in schools in the first week of January following a surge in the number of new coronavirus infections caused by the Omicron subspecies. At least 90 schools in the capital Jakarta must again be temporarily

closed as several students and their teachers contracted COVID-19 (Nupus, 2022).

In early April 2020, the Indonesian government laid down strict policies through extensive social restrictions to curb the spread of COVID-19 and limit people's movements. The Ministry of Education and Culture has issued guidelines stipulating that learning should be conducted in home or online mode, and the Indonesian television, so-called TVRI, broadcasts these educational modules daily at all educational levels. Four countries in the East Asia and Pacific region, including Indonesia, have yet to introduce full face-to-face learning. Twenty-three countries, or about 85% of the region, offer full face-to-face instruction. These 23 countries are Vietnam, China, Cambodia and Laos (Henderman, 2021).

The impact of the pandemic is very serious in Indonesia. The high mortality rate proves it. To curb the spread of the virus, the Minister of Education and the government have introduced an online learning system, but it has been found to be less effective in primary schools, especially physical education and health classes that require a lot of physical activity. Various obstacles to networked learning models have led educators to prefer limited face-to-face learning models to deliver teaching materials to their students. Despite the high risk, this limited face-to-face learning model is used more effectively than other learning models. To reduce your risk, you should follow a health protocol before you start learning. These limited face-to-face instruction results indicate that the student has a better understanding of the material at his MI Maalif NU Kevalandono. As a proposal, professional teachers must be able to adapt to classroom learning in all situations so that they can adequately convey to students the competencies expected in the curriculum (Prasetyo, 2022).

Offline learning is learning where teachers and students are all offline and face-to-face. Educators provide materials to students in the form of paperwork that takes place outside of school. Offline, learning media from television, radio, independent learning models and worksheets, printed materials, teaching materials, and objects within the school environment, depending on the availability and readiness of teacher and student facilities and infrastructure. use (Prasetyo et al., 2021).

➤ *Research Literature*

• *Foreign*

Alawajee and Almutairi (2022) investigated teachers' levels of commitment to classroom instruction of students with special educational needs in the post-COVID-19 period. Teachers' concerns about students' needs and their involvement in planning the teaching process in the classroom have been shown to predict a teacher's level of preparedness. The results also suggest that these special educators believed they were ready to return to classroom teaching. Face-to-face classes are an appropriate learning environment for students with special needs. Some

fruitful suggestions for educational development during the post-pandemic transition to face-to-face education are presented.

Kang et al. (2022) investigated the impact and necessary preparation of new face-to-face learning for early childhood teachers at Shanghai University. As a result, his ECTE in Australia outperforms his ECTE in China in terms of proficiency and progress in using online education platforms, experimentation with different teaching styles, online teaching skills, literacy, and competence is ready. However, the coded data showed that her ECTE in Australia and China, who participated, held similar views on the adverse effects of the change: B. Poor interaction, broken social and emotional ties, increased workload, and less burden on staff. Findings suggest that TEIs in Australia and China need to develop contextualized strategies and innovative solutions to meet the challenges of lockdowns. During the coronavirus pandemic, face-to-face classes must be organized for students with difficulty accessing digital learning opportunities.

Many Indonesian students need help because they either have a mobile phone or cannot afford an internet data plan to access the internet. The effectiveness of online home education during the COVID-19 pandemic is being monitored by the Indonesian Child Protection Commission (KPAI). Restrictions on online learning are becoming increasingly important, according to a survey conducted by the commission in 34 provinces in Indonesia. Therefore, on-site learning was recommended (Pradana, 2021).

Lessler (2021) analyzed data collected from 2,142,887 respondents in the 50 US states and Washington, DC, over two time periods, 2020-2021. Collected. During this period, 576,051 reported having at least one of her K-12 children living in the household. 49% of these respondents said their resident children participate in full-time or part-time classroom instruction, but there was wide variation within and between states. Overall, classroom training increased from 48% to 52% for her two periods, although there was a decrease in some states.

We performed several stratified analyses to address the possibility that the association with in-person schooling could result from differences between urban, suburban, and rural counties; local patterns of incidence; or other differences between those more and less likely to send children to school in person. When stratifying by the propensity for in-person schooling and counties classified by size, metro status, or incidence, we found few systematic or statistically significant deviations from overall estimates, even if overall outcomes rates differed (i.e., little evidence of effect modification by strata). We found similar results when stratifying counties by reported schooling behaviors, state, percent white, poverty, and access to broadband internet. The notable exception is an apparent increase in the risk associated with in-person schooling in households with a higher propensity to have children attending in-person classes (Lessler, 2021).

According to Fernandes (2022), UNICEF's representative in Hanoi, over 6,000 students from seventh to 12th grades in Hanoi's COVID-19 low and medium-risk areas (labeled green and yellow) returned to school on February 8. Meanwhile, two days later, more than 455,000 primary and 74,600 sixth graders in 18 suburbs returned to school. Due to the recent pandemic, the rest of the students in Hanoi were scheduled to return to school on February 21, and the kindergarteners were also due to return. The challenge for teachers is to ensure that children's schooling is irretrievably lost in the pandemic and that learning opportunities are not missed. Additionally, there is growing evidence that COVID-19 causes anxiety and depression in high rates of children and adolescents. Some studies have concluded that girls, adolescents, and people living in rural areas are most likely to be affected by these problems.

Face-to-face classes began early in the school year in Singapore, but the challenge remains of whether students can return to the classroom in each school, especially private ones. The state government has suggested physical conditioning for the resumption of classes. Face-to-face classes were implemented in phases, and admission restrictions and staggered entry were thoroughly managed. Another challenge for schools is fever measurements, fixed exam-style seating arrangements, wipe-down routines after each class, no sharing of devices between students during physical education classes, and others imposed by school departments. It implemented religiously significant activities, such as the policy that schools in Singapore must also adhere to good hygiene practices and regularly clean common areas such as dining rooms, handrails, and doorknobs. School security measures require additional human resources. Special arrangements have also been made, especially for elementary school students, to ensure safety on school grounds and in classrooms (Ang, 2022).

• *Local*

Amri et al. (2021) conducted a survey titled "Teacher Voices on School Reopening in Indonesia during the COVID-19 Pandemic". This survey is being conducted to assess the perspectives of teachers and other educators on the current situation and prospects for reopening schools. Results suggest that 76% of teachers are concerned about schools reopening due to health risks, and 95% want to continue blended or distance learning. Nonetheless, when schools reopen, teachers should ensure that health protection for teachers and children is enhanced, coordination and cooperation with local stakeholders are enhanced, and learning processes are safe, comfortable, and effective. Expressed the need for additional capacity building to ensure A specific analysis of the perspectives and needs of teachers working with learners with special needs and disadvantaged areas will be analyzed further.

One of the teachers' challenges in face-to-face learning is indigenizing instructional materials to facilitate the easy absorption of lessons. The study of Rasna (2018) proposed the localization of instructional materials in the Province of Bali using an ethnopedagogic strategy. The consensus

among Bali teachers showed that they preferred the development of an integrated theme-based coursebook. When tested on several grade levels, the results showed that learners could understand their lessons well, and social competence was equally improved.

Part of the pedagogical challenges of some Indonesian teachers is using scaffolding to help simplify complex lessons. The study by Padmadewi (2018) during the pre-pandemic era analyzed the implementation of scaffolding in teaching elementary English. Research showed that teachers used multiple scaffolding strategies, including process-based writing techniques, sight word practice, and problem-solving-based learning instruction with reading response diaries. Using scaffolding strategies, we see significant improvements not only in writing quality but also in terms of student attitudes and interests. This result suggests that the framework's quality positively contributes to students' writing skills.

The administration of assessments has also been clouded with doubts because of the pedagogical skills of some teachers. This concerns their ability to strategize in providing assessments. Defiant (2018) evaluated the use of formative assessments by English First Language (EFL) teachers in secondary schools in Indonesia. Researchers believed that formative assessment was a means of improving student learning. The study found that the teachers who participated in this study were able to provide excellent examples of how formative assessment can be conducted using tools such as three-line writing, public speaking, and video conferencing. I understand. In addition, the study found that despite the culture of testing embedded in the Indonesian education system, teachers were able to create a space for formative assessment.

Soesanto and Dirgantoro (2021) conducted a cross-sectional study that addressed three issues: student perceptions of previous painful learning, limited personal transitions, and teachers' expectations of transitions. The online survey was created in two formats: a 5-point Likert scale and an open-ended question. As a result, the advantages and disadvantages of implementing emergency learning were clarified. Overall, students welcomed the transition, expecting teachers to prepare their teaching strategies appropriately. In addition, it provides opportunities for all educators to pursue new explorations and improve a positive learning environment. Sutini et al. (2022) investigated readiness for offline learning with COVID-19 prevention protocols in early September 2021. However, this policy may cause parents to worry about their child's health during in-person classes. The results showed higher parental attitudes toward the strengths and weaknesses of offline teaching compared to online learning. Parents also strongly believed in the advantages and disadvantages of offline (classroom) teaching compared to online learning. Teachers also surveyed said they were highly motivated to study offline despite the pandemic. Findings suggest that introducing offline learning during the pandemic elicited a positive response from families.

Individuals may also benefit from targeted health education programs to enhance their knowledge and beliefs about COVID-19 and prepare them for offline learning during the COVID-19 pandemic.

Indonesian schools have largely relied on collaborative governance to reopen schools after the devastating impact of the COVID-19 pandemic. Hendarman (2021) describes how a policy to accelerate the opening of classroom education known as Surat Keputusan Bersama 4 Menteri or a joint decree by four ministers (i.e. Minister of Religious Affairs, Minister of Health, etc.). We conducted a study to examine whether internal affairs, education, culture, research, and technology) and its impact. The joint decree stipulates how schools will be allowed to reopen after the number of COVID-19 cases has decreased. Data were collected from relevant regulations, government documents, and scientific writings. The joint decree was found to be recognized and implemented in different ways based on the roles and responsibilities of each ministry at central and local levels. The success of accelerated school opening depends on the factors involved – local governments, schools, parents, and communities – understanding their respective roles and responding to existing problems and remedies when new clusters emerge. It depends on a level of open, accountable, and collaborative governance. When conducting face-to-face classes after COVID-19, the leadership of local leaders is key to the safety and health of students and teaching staff. In addition, media campaigns should be encouraged to achieve common awareness of various interest groups.

Indonesian schools operated their face-to-face classes under four policy-plan. First Policy involved full capacity with 100% class attendance permitted to have six (6) hours of classes. This is allowed for the schools whose personnel are at least 80% vaccinated, and at least 50% of adults in the region are vaccinated. The second policy allows full capacity but with limited time for face-to-face classes. This allows 100% attendance but only 4 hours of classes. It is required that at least 50% of school personnel are vaccinated, and at least 40% of the elders are fully vaccinated in the region. The third policy allowed 50% of class attendance with 6 hours of classes each session provided 50-80% of the school personnel have been fully vaccinated, and 40-50% of elders in the area were vaccinated. Furthermore, the fourth policy allows 50% of class attendance in shifting sessions with 4 hours of class per shift. This requires that at least 40% of school personnel be fully vaccinated and that at least 40% of adults in the region have been fully vaccinated (Safira, 2022).

On 15 June 2020, the Ministry of Education and Culture, together with the Task Force to Accelerate the Response to COVID-19, the Ministry of Human Development and Cultural Coordination, the Ministry of Religious Affairs, the Ministry of Health, the Ministry of Home Affairs, and the Secretariat of the National Disaster Management Agency decision to establish and high fees). Face-to-face classes in Green (no COVID-19

cases) academic units are permitted under very strict multi-level requirements. Regarding student numbers, 94% are in 429 counties/cities in these three zones. Only about 6% of students live in green areas (Rahiem, 2020).

According to the Saphira Policy Review (2022) by the Indonesian Center for Policy Studies, most parents are satisfied with the face-to-face learning policy, stating that it provides a more favorable learning environment than distance learning. Parents also had the final say on whether their children could return to school or continue their online education from home, so they were happy with their choice within this policy.

In December 2021, MOECRT, jointly with the Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA), Ministry of Religious Affairs (MORA), Ministry of Health, and Ministry of Interior, issued Joint Decree No. 03/KB/2021 No.2. 384/2021, No.HK.01.08/MENKES/424/2021, and No.440-717/2021. This permits face-to-face classes for educational units of a specific zone (aka Pemberakuan Pembatasan Kegiatan Masyarakat 1 or PPKM level). 1, 2, 3 areas). The policy has several requirements, such as compliance with Covid-19 safety protocols (aka 5M2), vaccination of educational personnel, verification and assessment of school readiness by local leaders, and MOECRT or MORA (Madrasa 3). was included. Schools must continue distance learning if these conditions are not met. The same is true for schools in PPKM Level 4 regions. Schools could implement attendance rules in four different ways.

Prasetillo et al. (2022) studied limited face-to-face learning methods to overcome learning disabilities during a pandemic. The Ministry of Education and the government have found that online learning systems may have been more effective at the primary school level, especially physical education and health classes that require a lot of physical activity. Various obstacles to network learning models have led educators to prefer limited face-to-face learning models to deliver teaching materials to their students. Despite the significant risks, this limited face-to-face learning model is used more effectively than others. To reduce your risk, you should follow a health protocol before learning. These limited face-to-face instruction results indicate that the student better understands the material at his MI Maalif NU Kevalandono. As a suggestion, professional teachers must be able to adapt to classroom learning in all situations to convey to students the competencies expected in the curriculum adequately.

➤ *Synthesis*

The implementation of face-to-face classes in Indonesia and elsewhere in the world shared common challenges in the implementation and readiness of teachers, parents, and institutions. Whether private or public, the need for educators to be ready to carry out national policies had shared commonalities.

In this presentation, teachers' readiness to implement face-to-face classes was associated with personal competence, which is also affected by the school's readiness. The extent of compliance of teachers and schools is also high, as most of the policies implemented in Indonesia and many countries are from the national level. Teachers' challenges in implementing face-to-face learning appear to be mostly associated with physical preparations. There were limited studies that detailed the internal difficulties of teachers.

In this chapter, the studies culled will be used to support the discussions of results in the next chapters.

V. SUMMARY OF FINDINGS, CONCLUSIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

This chapter presents key results obtained during the study, the conclusions coined from the said results, and the recommendations based on identified areas indicating some problems.

➤ *Summary of Findings*

Most of the respondents belong to the younger group. More than half of the respondents are Male, and most are married. Regarding education, most respondents belong to the lower group or those with no Master' or Doctorate Degree.

The level of teachers' readiness in implementing face-to-face learning in Instructional Materials, Management of Learning, and Administration of Assessment are all high. The lowest mean score was on instructional materials.

Teachers have a high level of compliance in teaching materials, learning management, evaluation management, etc. in thorough face-to-face classes. Teaching materials also had the lowest averages.

Teachers face great difficulties in implementing full-fledged face-to-face classes, such as teaching materials, learning management, and evaluation management. Learning management had the highest average score.

When grouped according to the variables above, teachers' willingness to fully implement face-to-face teaching was consistently high. Grouping according to the variables above, the level of teacher compliance in fully implementing face-to-face instruction was high.

Grouping according to the variables above, the difficulty for teachers to fully implement face-to-face teaching was high.

In terms of teaching materials and evaluation management, the motivation to thoroughly implement face-to-face classes was the same. However, when grouped and compared according to highest educational level, there were large differences in willingness to manage learning.

No significant differences were found in the degree of adherence to full implementation of face-to-face instruction when grouped and compared according to the variables above. When grouped and compared according to the variables above, the difficulty of fully implementing face-to-face instruction did not change.

➤ *Conclusions*

The lowest mean score in teachers' readiness level was on instructional materials. This means some teachers may need more time to prepare for new instructional materials. Just as classes re-opened after two years of closure, the learning needs of the students may have changed as the modality equally changed. The result indicates the need for the teachers to have more time to prepare.

The extent of teachers' compliance was lowest in instructional materials. This means that teachers need more time to comply with the required preparation period to ensure that all learning and teaching materials are readily available for the students and teachers. It is a known fact that the decision to re-open the schools was met with various opposition from other sectors. Therefore, the decision to fully re-open was not 100% sure yet. When it was decided to open fully, the remaining time for the teachers to secure all the needed learning resource materials may have needed to be improved.

The Management of Learning came out as the biggest challenge or difficulty of the teachers in fully implementing face-to-face learning. This can be attributed to the fact that the school management is yet uncertain at that time whether face-to-face would go full blast (5 days a week). It will be hybridized with Online Learning due to the uncertainty of the spreading of Coronavirus at that time. The teachers were mainly challenged in managing students learning at that time because the situation was too volatile back then.

Teacher readiness levels were high when grouped by the variables above, but lowest for materials. This is because learners will need more time to prepare and obtain the materials they need when they return to face-to-face classes.

The extent of compliance was high when grouped and compared according to the aforementioned variables, but instructional materials received the lowest mean score. This is indicative of the fact that time constraint was a vital element in the process of complying with the needed resources to be prepared. The teachers were given a very limited time to prepare prior to the actual re-opening of classes.

The level of teachers' difficulties in fully implementing face-to-face learning when grouped according to the aforementioned variables was lowest in the Management of Learning. There were uncertainties about whether full face-to-face will be implemented or partial. Managing classes using different modalities takes time indeed to process.

There was a significant difference in the level of readiness in terms of Management of Learning when grouped and compared according to highest educational attainment. This means that the respondents who belong to the lower category view learning management from a different perspective than the teachers with higher educational attainment. Those teachers with higher educational attainment viewed learning management from a different and more mature perspective than those from the lower group.

There were no significant differences in the degree of adherence to full face-to-face instruction when grouped and compared according to the variables above. This means all respondents have the same opinion in assessing their adherence to required compliance regarding face-to-face learning. This will positively impact the school because teachers have the same high level of compliance.

The difficulty of fully implementing face-to-face instruction was similar when grouped and compared according to the variables above. This means all respondents have the same outlook on their difficulties centred on learning management. This means that all the teachers were having issues managing the learning process, especially with the consistency and learning modalities.

➤ *Recommendations*

- Operationalize a program called LOC-IN, known as Localization and Indigenization of the instructional materials. The School Head and the teachers will spearhead the LOC-IN Project. For the Localization part, there shall be a policy that curriculum must use local materials in the discussions of textbooks and instructional materials. For example, when giving examples, teachers must use local products that students regularly see in the community – like fruits, and other foodstuffs, to visualize flavours, enhance sensibility, examine fractions, and many others. For the Indigenization part, the teachers must incorporate Indonesian culture, community practices, and beliefs in most discussions to enhance students a better understanding so students can relate. The contextualized and indigenized curriculum must be put into trial, and the results must be presented to the Ministry of Education district officials for the proposal's official inclusion in its yearly curricular assessments.
- Utilize Instructional Scaffolding to Improve Learning (ISIL) and Collaborative Learning (COLE) to ensure that learners' instructional needs are well-provided. Classroom teachers shall be tasked as implementors of these two (2) programs, and both programs can be applied as teachers deem necessary in every subject. There will be a workshop for the teachers to re-train and refresh the utilization of ISIL and COLE in the class. The workshop shall be conducted on three consecutive days during mid-year semestral breaks to maintain the normal academic flow. This shall be done every summer.

- Implement the Formative Assessments (FORMAS) program to help teachers personalize assessments based on individual students' learning needs. The teacher-in-charge shall be provided with a 2-day workshop during mid-year summer break to ensure they master the art of giving formative assessments to students. Formative assessments will be in the likes of these activities: Asking students what subjects they find hard to understand and letting them explain why; providing specific worksheets or journals to students to express their thoughts on the subject; asking students to write daily evaluations of the classes they find difficult; and ask students to do self-evaluation of their performance every quarter.

REFERENCES

- [1]. Alawajee, Omar and Almutairi, Hamaed. (2022). Level of Readiness for In-Class Teaching Among Teachers of Students with Special Educational Needs: Post-COVID-19. *Eurasian Journal of Educational Research*. Vol. 98, No. 1. Pp. 1-20.
- [2]. Amri, Avianto, et al. (2021). Teachers' voices on school reopening in Indonesia during COVID-19 pandemic. *Social Sciences & Humanities Open*. Vol. 4, No. 1.
- [3]. Andarwulan, Trisna, et al. (2021). Elementary Teachers' Readiness toward the Online Learning Policy in the New Normal Era during COVID-19. *International Journal of Instruction*. Vol. 14, No. 3. Pp771-786.
- [4]. Ang, Jolene. (2022). Singapore schools to open in phases from June 2 after Covid-19 circuit breaker: How this will work? *The Strait Times Singapore*. <https://www.straittimes.com/singapore/schools-to-open-in-phases-from-june-2-after-covid-19-circuit-breaker-how-this-will-work>
- [5]. CNN Philippines. (2022). Filipino students return to face-to-face classes after 2 years of distance learning. Published August 22, 2022. Accessed on 3 December 2022 from <https://www.cnnphilippines.com/news/2022/8/22/Face-to-face-classes-school-year-2022-2023-COVID-19-pandemic.html>
- [6]. Chisadza, Carolyn. (2021). Online and face-to-face learning: Evidence from students' performance during the Covid-19 pandemic. *African Development Review*. <https://doi.org/10.1111/1467-8268.12520>
- [7]. Delvigne-Jean, Thierry. (2022). Indonesia: After 18 months of school closures, children must safely resume face-to-face learning as soon as possible – UNICEF/WHO. United Nations Children's Educational Fund. <https://www.unicef.org/press-releases/indonesia-after-18-months-school-closures-children-must-safely-resume-face-face>
- [8]. Dorsah, Philip. (2021). Pre-service Teachers' Readiness for Emergency Remote Learning in the Wake of COVID-19. *European Journal of STEM Education*, 6(1), 01. <https://doi.org/10.20897/ejsteme/9557>
- [9]. Fernandez, Raquel. (2022). UNICEF Representative: children should be in school for their best interests. <https://www.unicef.org/vietnam/press-releases/unicef-representative-children-should-be-school-their-best-interests-%E2%80%8B>
- [10]. Gupta, Aarti and Palmer, Neil. (2021). How independent schools can prepare for a post-Covid future.
- [11]. Hendarman, Hendarman. (2021). Collaborative Governance for Reopening Schools in Indonesia Following the COVID-19 Pandemic. KNE Publishing. DOI: 10.18502/kss.v7i9.10958
- [12]. Henebery, Brett. (2022). How principals can get compliance right in 2022. *The Educator Australia*. <https://www.theeducatoronline.com/k12/news/how-principals-can-get-compliance-right-in-2022/280606>
- [13]. Kan, Li, et al. (2022). Similar Impact, Different Readiness: A Comparative Study of the Impact of COVID-19 on ECTE Practice.
- [14]. Kuchay, Bilal. (2021). Schools in Indian capital reopen for all classes after 19 months. <https://www.aljazeera.com/news/2021/11/1/india-new-delhi-schools-reopen-all-classes-covid>
- [15]. Lessler, Justin, et al. (2021). Household COVID-19 risk and in-person schooling. *International Journal of Science*. Vol. 372, No. 6546.
- [16]. Lin, Shing-Ling, et al. (2021). Experiences and Challenges of an English as a Medium of Instruction Course in Taiwan during COVID-19. *International Journal of Environmental Research and Public Health*.
- [17]. Prasetyo, Yoyok, et al. (2022). FACE-TO-FACE LEARNING METHODS ARE LIMITED IN OVERCOMING STUDENTS' LEARNING DIFFICULTIES DURING THE PANDEMIC COVID-19. *Indonesian Journal of Research and Educational Review*. Vol. 1, No. 3, Pp. 286-296.
- [18]. Pradana, Mahir and Syarifuddin, Syarifuddin. (2021). The Struggle Is Real: Constraints of Online Education in Indonesia During the COVID-19 Pandemic. *Frontiers of Education*. Opinion Article. <https://doi.org/10.3389/feduc.2021.753776>
- [19]. Prasetyo, Yoyok, et al. (2022). FACE-TO-FACE LEARNING METHODS ARE LIMITED IN OVERCOMING STUDENTS' LEARNING DIFFICULTIES DURING THE PANDEMIC COVID-19. *Indonesian Journal of Research and Educational Review*. Volume 1, No. 3, 2022, pp 286-296.
- [20]. Magsambol, Bonz. (2022). After 2 years of distance learning, PH schools return to face-to-face classes. *Education in the Philippines*. A Feature Stor on Rappler.com
- [21]. Muna, Ayesha Nadya and Krismantaru, Ika. (2020). Why blended learning during COVID-19 in Indonesia isn't easy. *Learn Tech Asia*. <https://learntechasia.com/indonesia-covid-19-blended-learning/>
- [22]. Nupus, Hayati. (2022). Roundup: Indonesian schools reopen face-to-face class despite Omicron scare. *Asia & the Pacific News*. <https://english.news.cn/asiapacific/20220129/bc1097f4276e49df9e5f35f0e8fcffa5/c.html>

- [23]. Rahiem, Maila D.H. (2020). Indonesian University Students' Likes and Dislikes about Emergency Remote Learning during the COVID-19 Pandemic. <https://files.eric.ed.gov/fulltext/EJ1291034.pdf>
- [24]. Safira, Latasha. (2022). Parent's Perception on Face-to-Face Learning. Policy Brief No. 4. Center for Indonesian Policy Studies.
- [25]. Sarmiento, Philip Joseph. (2021). Face-to-face classes during COVID-19: a call for deliberate and well-planned school health protocols in the Philippine context. *Journal of Public Health Oxford*. doi: 10.1093/pubmed/fdab006
- [26]. Sigue-Bisnar, Mai. (2022). Beyond the return to face-to-face classes. Insights and Update Published in The Manila Times on 31 August 2022. <https://www.granthornton.com.ph/insights/articles-and-updates1/from-where-we-sit/beyond-the-return-to-face-to-face-classes/>
- [27]. Soesanto, Robert Harry and Dirgantoro, Kurnia Putri. (2021). Welcome back to face-to-face: A novel Indonesian issue of students' perceptions towards learning transition. *Issues in Educational Research*. Vol. 31. No. 4.
- [28]. Sutini, Titin, et al. (2022). Offline Learning Readiness during COVID-19 Pandemic: Indonesian' Parent Knowledge, Belief, and Attitude.
- [29]. Ulfiana, Ajeng. (2021). Indonesia schools start cautious reopening after devastating virus wave. <https://www.reuters.com/world/asia-pacific/indonesia-schools-start-cautious-reopening-after-devastating-virus-wave-2021-08-30/>
- [30]. Yulisman, Linda. (2021). Schools reopen throughout Indonesia amid mixed reactions from parents. *The Strait Times*. Published August 30, 2021.